REL: 12/07/2007

Notice: This opinion is subject to formal revision before publication in the advance sheets of <u>Southern Reporter</u>. Readers are requested to notify the **Reporter of Decisions**, Alabama Appellate Courts, 300 Dexter Avenue, Montgomery, Alabama 36104-3741 ((334) 229-0649), of any typographical or other errors, in order that corrections may be made before the opinion is printed in <u>Southern Reporter</u>.

ALABAMA COURT OF CIVIL APPEALS

2060794	

OCTOBER TERM, 2007-2008

Antonio Saldana Hernandez and Sandy Herman-Hernandez

v.

City of Hoover and Jacob Pugh

Appeal from Jefferson Circuit Court (CV-06-3669)

MOORE, Judge.

AFFIRMED. NO OPINION.

See Rule 53(a)(1) and (a)(2)(E), Ala. R. App. P.; <u>Ernst</u>
& Young, <u>LLP v. Tucker</u>, 940 So. 2d 269, 284 (Ala. 2006); <u>Ex</u>
parte Cranman, 792 So. 2d 392 (Ala. 2000); Matthews v. Alabama

2060794

<u>Agric. & Mech. Univ.</u>, 787 So. 2d 691 (Ala. 2000); <u>Smith v.</u>

<u>Union Bank & Trust Co.</u>, 653 So. 2d 933, 934 (Ala. 1995); <u>Lott v. Toomey</u>, 477 So. 2d 316, 319 (Ala. 1985); and <u>Thurmond v.</u>

<u>City of Huntsville</u>, 904 So. 2d 314, 319 (Ala. Civ. App. 2004).

Pittman, Bryan, and Thomas, JJ., concur.

Thompson, P.J., dissents, with writing.

2060794

THOMPSON, Presiding Judge, dissenting.

"For a summary judgment to be proper, there must be no genuine issue of material fact and the movant must be entitled to a judgment as a matter of law. Ala. R. Civ. P. 56(c), <u>Tripp v. Humana, Inc.</u>, 474 So. 2d 88 (Ala. 1985). Further, on review of a summary judgment we must view all the evidence in a light most favorable to the nonmovant and we must entertain all reasonable inferences from the evidence in favor of the nonmovant. <u>Fincher v. Robinson Bros. Lincoln-Mercury</u>, 583 So. 2d 256 (Ala. 1991)."

<u>First Fin. Ins. Co. v. Tillery</u>, 626 So. 2d 1252, 1254 (Ala. 1993).

Because I believe that the evidence contained in the record on appeal, when viewed in a light most favorable to the plaintiffs, created a genuine issue of material fact to be decided by a jury, I would reverse the summary judgment in favor of the defendants.

Therefore, I respectfully dissent.